Dear Ms Pafitis, Ms Verduci

Expression of concern about the proposed retraction of Foxon et al. paper regarding the relationship between smoking prevalence and e-cigarette use among US adults

We write as experienced academics and experts in tobacco science and policy with no relevant competing interests concerning the tobacco or ENDS industries. We refer to the paper by Foxon et al. and the journal’s apparent intention to retract this paper.


The study provides analysis that supports an important public health insight – that smoking prevalence has dropped faster than expected based on population trends and that this accelerated decline is correlated with increased e-cigarette use. While the paper is not and cannot be conclusive about causation, it adds to a diverse body of suggestive evidence, including from trials, other population data, observational studies, and economic data that imply that e-cigarettes may be displacing smoking in the US adult population, with potentially significant public health benefits. This is not a novel perspective or a self-serving industry talking point. This prospect was highlighted in a 2021 essay by fifteen former presidents of the Society for Research on Nicotine and Tobacco, the relevant scholarly society.1

It is essential that the public health community understands the interactions between cigarette and e-cigarette use. Misunderstanding this relationship could lead policymakers, practitioners, and the public towards foreseeable but harmful unintended consequences, such as increased smoking.

We were concerned, therefore, to learn that BMC Public Health may retract this paper. We have seen the commentaries and correspondence below and do not see a case for retraction or correction at this time.

- Retraction Watch, Exclusive: Public health journal says it will retract vaping paper for questions authors say were addressed in peer review, July 27, 2023. https://bit.ly/44RqiQy

The authors appear to have addressed the various concerns raised in their responses to the pre-publication peer reviews and their sensitivity analysis, which shows that the findings are robust under a range of initial assumptions.

We are aware of the authors’ role as consultants for Juul Labs Inc., not least because it has been transparently disclosed by the authors throughout the editorial review process. The reported conflicts justify due skepticism and scrutiny. They do not justify unfair or unequal treatment. The proper way to respond is through the open science concept of replication to confirm, refute, or challenge the findings using the same publicly available datasets.

While we wish to register concern over the proposed retraction, we understand that we may not be acquainted with all the facts. We would be grateful, therefore, if you could provide further information on the following:

- The analysis that justifies a retraction and the rejection of the authors’ sensitivity analysis.
- The process followed and its alignment with COPE retraction guidance.
- The basis of a decision to retract rather than correct or clarify the paper.

We hope that further consideration of the retraction of this paper reaches a satisfactory conclusion with due regard for scientific integrity, open science, and publication ethics.

Please correspond with Professor Ray Niaura [Niaura@nyu.edu] as the point of contact. Thank you for your urgent consideration.

Yours sincerely

David Abrams, Ph.D.  
Professor of Social and Behavioral Sciences  
School of Global Public Health  /New York University

Scott D. Ballin, J.D.  
Former Vice President and Legislative Counsel to the American Heart Association  
Former Chairman of the Coalition on Smoking OR Health (ACS, AHA, ALA)

Director, Counterfactual Consulting  
Former Director, Action on Smoking and Health  
London  
United Kingdom

K. Michael Cummings, Ph.D., MPH  
Professor, Department of Psychiatry & Behavioral Sciences  
Medical University of South Carolina  
Charleston

Clifford E. Douglas, JD  
Adjunct Professor, School of Public Health  
Director, Tobacco Research Network  
University of Michigan

Jonathan Foulds, Ph.D.  
Professor, Department of Public Health Sciences  
Interim Chief, Division of Health Services and Behavioral Research  
Professor, Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Health  
Penn State Cancer Institute

Abigail S. Friedman, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Department of Health Policy and Management  
Yale School of Public Health

Thomas J. Glynn, Ph.D.  
Adjunct Lecturer  
Prevention Research Center  
School of Medicine  
Stanford University

---

Peter Hajek, Ph.D.
Professor of Clinical Psychology,
Director of the Health and Lifestyle Research Unit
Wolfson Institute of Population Health
Queen Mary University
London, United Kingdom

Dorothy K. Hatsukami, Ph.D.
Professor of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences
Forster Family Chair in Cancer Prevention
Associate Director, Masonic Cancer Center
University of Minnesota

Martin Jarvis, D.Sc., OBE
Emeritus Professor of Health Psychology
University College London, United Kingdom

Lynn T. Kozlowski, Ph.D.
Dean Emeritus
Professor Emeritus
Department of Community Health and Health Behavior
School of Public Health and Health Professions
University at Buffalo

Scott J. Leischow, Ph.D.
Research Professor
College of Health Solutions
Arizona State University

David Levy, Ph.D.
Professor of Oncology, School of Medicine,
Cancer Prevention and Control Program
Georgetown Lombardi Comprehensive Cancer Center, Georgetown University

Robin Mermelstein, Ph.D.
Distinguished Professor, Liberal Arts and Sciences Psychology Department
Director, Institute for Health Research and Policy
Co-Director, Center for Clinical and Translational Science
University of Illinois at Chicago

Raymond S. Niaura, Ph.D.
Chair of the Department of Epidemiology
Professor, Social and Behavioral Sciences
College of Global Public Health
New York University

Michael F. Pesko, Ph.D.
J. Rhoads Foster Professor
Department of Economics
University of Missouri

Vaughan W. Rees, Ph.D.
Senior Lecturer on Social and Behavioral Sciences
Director, Center for Global Tobacco Control
Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences
Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health

Nancy A. Rigotti, M.D.
Professor of Medicine
Harvard Medical School
Director, Tobacco Research & Treatment Center, Massachusetts General Hospital

Steven A. Schroeder, M.D.
Professor Emeritus,
Department of Medicine
University of California, San Francisco

David T. Sweanor, J.D.
Advisory Committee Chair,
University of Ottawa Centre for Health Law, Policy and Ethics
Adjunct Professor, Faculty of Law
University of Ottawa, Canada

Kenneth E. Warner, Ph.D.
Avedis Donabedian Distinguished University Professor Emeritus
Dean Emeritus
University of Michigan School of Public Health

Robert West, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor
Behavioural Science and Health
Institute of Epidemiology & Health
University College London